



Parshas Noach 5769

October 31, '08  
Volume VIII Issue 1

## Hilchos B'rachos part XIII

### Consuming Cake During a Bread Meal – Part I

In the previous shiur we commenced discussing partaking of cake during a meal and whether it requires a בורא מיני מזונות. To appreciate the deliberation we must understand the concept of פת הבאה בכיסנין.

פת הבאה בכיסנין literally means pocket shaped bread. We recite the *b'racha boreh minei mezonos* on cake, cookies and biscuits as opposed to *hamotzi*, even though these items are grain based.

The reason *mezonos* is recited is because Chazal did not require washing hands and *hamotzi* for items not normally eaten as a meal.<sup>1</sup>

#### What defines cake and cookies?

We find three opinions in *halacha*:

#### Kneaded<sup>2</sup>

The *Mechaber* (Sephardim): dough kneaded with fruit juice, sugar, oil and other substances, which produce a noticeable taste in the final product.

The Rama (Ashkenazim): dough kneaded with more fruit juice, oil, sugar etc. than water.

Since bread is not usually made this way, this product is called פת הבאה בכיסנין and its *b'racha* is *mezonos*.

#### Filling<sup>3</sup>

A pastry baked with a filling comprised of honey or sugar, nuts or flavor.<sup>4</sup> Certain criteria must be met such as: the filling can be tasted in the dough,<sup>5</sup> and the filling was baked with the dough and not merely added later.<sup>6</sup>

This is true even if the dough is comprised of only water and flour.<sup>7</sup>

#### Crusty<sup>8</sup>

Dough baked into a crusty substance such as crackers, baigelach and cookies (biscuits) are not bread and the required *b'racha* is בורא מיני מזונות. It is for this reason that Sephardim recite *mezonos* over matzo eaten during the year. On Pesach Sephardim do recite *hamotzi* on matzo.

#### Do these three opinions disagree with each other?

<sup>1</sup> See MB *siman* 168:23, שערי הברכה טז הערה צב.

<sup>2</sup> Rambam.

<sup>3</sup> R' Chananel, *Oruch*, *Tur* and *Rashba*.

<sup>4</sup> *Siman* 168:7.

<sup>5</sup> MB *siman* 168:28.

<sup>6</sup> MB *siman* 168:27, שערי הברכה טז מז.

<sup>7</sup> MB *ibid*.

<sup>8</sup> *Oruch* citing Rav Hai.

The *Shulchan Aruch* writes <sup>9</sup> that the *halacha* is in accordance with all three opinions, which means that one recites a *mezonos* for each category. [Indeed we cannot say that all three opinions agree with each other, but we do not have evidence of any disagreement. The result is that one recites a *mezonos* for these categories]. <sup>10</sup>

*When do we recite a mezonos? During or at the end of a meal?*

If cake or cookies are eaten to satiate, i.e. one is still relatively hungry and cake etc. is eaten in lieu of bread or other “meal” foods, one does not recite a *mezonos* on cake. <sup>11</sup> This, in most part, is true when eating doughnuts or סופגניות at the conclusion of a meal.

If cake or cookies are consumed as dainties or dessert one recites a *mezonos*, on condition that they are פת הבאה בכיסנין according to all opinions. <sup>12</sup>

Although we recite *mezonos* over items that belong to **each one** of the above categories, nevertheless, according to several *poskim*, it is due to doubt whether the opinions argue, and if they do, it means that according to one opinion a particular item will require a *mezonos* and according to another opinion it will be *hamotzi*. So although we recite *mezonos* on all categories, when one recited *hamotzi* at the onset of the meal, it will include all items, unless a particular item satisfies all definitions, in which case everyone will definitely agree that the *b'racha* is *mezonos*.

**Crackers** – crackers satisfy the definition of פת הבאה בכיסנין according to one opinion, not according to the other two, consequently one normally recites a *mezonos*,

but when consumed during or at the end of a meal, one will not recite a *mezonos*.

**Sponge cake** – sponge cake satisfies the condition of being tasty and sweet but not the other two opinions, because it does not contain a filling, nor is it crusty. Consequently one normally recites a *mezonos*, but when consumed during or at the end of a meal, one will not recite a *mezonos*.

**Apple cake** – apple cake might contain a filling but it is not crusty. Sometimes the dough will be very sweet, but it still lacks one of the opinions. <sup>13</sup>

**Apple pie** – apple **pie** fulfills all three conditions; it has a crust, it contains apples and the dough is sweet. So when eaten as dessert one recites *mezonos*.

---

### Vort on the Parsha

The *posuke* says ויחל נח איש האדמה ויטע כרם, which literally means that Noach **first** planted a vineyard, but *Rashi* says that it means mundane as opposed to holiness. R' Itzaleh of Volozin explained this with a parable. A father said to his son before going out into the world, I bless you that the first thing you turn to will have tremendous success. If the son is ירא שמים, he has fear of heaven, he will turn to something spiritual such as learning Torah. If he is not he will turn to mundane matters.

*Hashem* had just blessed Noach, as it says ויברך אלקים את נח, and he ‘wasted’ it on a mundane matter, the vineyard.

---

Sponsored by ShemaYisrael UK.  
For sponsorship, please email  
[yehody@shemayisrael.com](mailto:yehody@shemayisrael.com)

לזכר נשמת חנה בת ברוך

---

<sup>9</sup> *Siman* 168:7.

<sup>10</sup> ד"ה מאמר מרדכי cited in *Bi'ur Halacha siman* 168:7 והלכה.

<sup>11</sup> Based on *MB siman* 168:41.

<sup>12</sup> An opinion reiterated by many *poskim*, see *Bi'ur Halacha siman* 168:8 ד"ה טעונים.

One may receive and distribute these weekly shiurim by calling or writing: Office 99 Rechov Bayit Vegan, Yerushalayim, Phone Numbers: U.S. and Canada 732-370-3344 Israel 972-3-616-6340

South Africa 076 187 1451 UK 44-020-8731-6666 Australia 61-296835626 Switzerland 0114143 333 0288

• e-mail: [shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com](mailto:shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com), or [www.shemayisrael.com](http://www.shemayisrael.com),

weekly sponsorships are available as well.

If you would like to send a question to Rav Ostroff, you can write to him at [shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com](mailto:shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com).

**Note:** The purpose of this series is intended solely for the clarification of the topics discussed and not to render halachic decisions. It is intended to heighten everyone's awareness of important practical questions which do arise on this topic. One must consult with a proper halachic authority in order to receive p'sak.

---

<sup>13</sup> It appears from the *Bi'ur Halacha* that one may recite *mezonos* on cakes with fillings, and Rav Sternbuch indeed says that one makes a *mezonos* on apple cake.