



Parshas Noach 5766

November 4, '05
Volume V Issue 1

What is the halacha with regards to immersing kishke inside cholent?

In previous shiurim we dealt with the two types of *batmana* (storing) - *batmana* that adds heat and *batmana* that does not add heat. The former is prohibited even before Shabbos and the latter is prohibited on Shabbos. Many are accustomed to placing *kishke* wrapped in plastic film or aluminum foil inside a *cholent* and the issue of *batmana* arises. Since heat is constantly added to the *kishke* it would seem to be prohibited even before Shabbos. What is the *heter*?

Several solutions:

- Hagaon Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach זצ"ל explained that it is not considered *batmana*.¹ The essence of *batmana* is to prevent heat loss but in this case it is not applicable. The *kishke* and *cholent* receive direct heat from the hotplate or fire and the *cholent* (which would be the *matmin* – the wrapper) is not needed to add heat to the *kishke*.
- Rav Eliyahu Falk *shlita* says that the problem exists when the *kishke* is wrapped in two covers but if wrapped in a single sheet of foil it is permitted.²
- Make holes in the wrapper surrounding the *kishke* or do not

allow the *kishke* to be totally submerged inside the *cholent*.³

May I put soup nuts into my soup?

To answer this we must familiarize ourselves with the concepts *ein bishul achar bishul* and *yeish bishul achar afiya*.

A fully cooked solid item is not subject to the restrictions of cooking and if certain conditions are complied with it may be reheated.

How do we know this?

The *Mishna* in *Shabbos* 145b says “anything placed in hot water before Shabbos may be immersed in hot water on Shabbos”. The *Tosefos*⁴ explains that the word ‘placed’ in the *Mishna* means ‘cooked’, i.e. something cooked before Shabbos may be reheated on Shabbos. The *Shulchan Aruch*⁵ cited this *halacha* but altered the word ‘placed’ in accordance with *Tosefos* and wrote “a dry item **fully cooked** before Shabbos may be immersed in hot water on Shabbos”.⁶

Why may one only reheat solids and not liquids?

The *gemora* in *Shabbos* 34a⁷ states that one may not wrap (*batmana*) an item on Shabbos lest one finds it cold and reheats it, which

¹ *Tikunim umiluim* chapter 42 footnote 242.

² The first wrapping is the natural container, which is not *batmana* and the second the storing – *batmana*. A single sheet wrapped around a few times is permitted.

³ See the *SS”K* 42:63 and footnote 242, but see the relevant *tikunim*.

⁴ *Shabbos* 39a ד"ה כל.

⁵ *Simon* 318:4.

⁶ See the *Beis Yosef simon* 318:4.

⁷ 2 lines from the bottom of the page.

would lead to the violation of cooking on Shabbos (*Rashi*).

The *Tur* was perturbed by this apparent contradiction to the *Mishna* cited above, which says that one may reheat a cooked item. He therefore explains that the *Mishna* refers to solid items and the *gemora* to items with liquid, such as meat with gravy or soup.

Conclusion – solid, dry items that are fully cooked such as schnitzels, *kugel*, chicken and meat may be reheated on Shabbos. Items containing liquid such as meat with gravy or soup may not be reheated on Shabbos.⁸

How is one to reheat solid cooked items?

It is crucial to note that two issues are involved in reheating. The first applies to the items being reheated, which is dealt with above. The second is the manner used to reheat.

We have previously learned that one may not place anything directly onto a heat source on Shabbos because it appears as if one is cooking. Consequently, food may not be placed directly onto a blech or hotplate⁹ and definitely even more so, not placed onto an open flame – electric or gas.

The preferred method is to place food onto a pot already on a heat source, such as a gas range, electric range, hotplate or blech. One may also place it on an electric urn.

How dry must a solid be to be called dry?

A moist solid (although slightly wet) may be reheated because moisture is of no

significance.¹⁰ Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach זצ"ל permits reheating *kugel* even though it is moist with oil.

So what's with the soup nuts?

Soup nuts (as opposed to croutons) are deep fried in oil and as such one may reheat them on Shabbos. Consequently, placing them into hot soup on Shabbos is permitted.

Vort on the Parsha

כי מלאה הארץ חמס מפניהם – *Rashi* explains that it was גזל – (robbery) that sealed the fate of that wicked generation and the question is why? HaRav Elyakim Getzel Levitan, the Maggid of Brisk, explained that *Hashem* wished to create the world based solely on the attribute of judgment but instead He merged mercy with judgment. Mercy's responsibility is to plead for wrongdoers and thus effectuate leniency or time to repent. Mercy cannot plead mercy and forgiveness for a robber because a third party is involved - the victim. Consequently, most other sins can be pardoned or condoned for a certain period but robbery and thievery cry for justice and mercy cannot interfere.

Food For Thought

What about putting matza or bread in soup?

May one place a wet soup ladle back into the soup pot?

Is there a problem placing a cooked item onto an urn?

What's the issue regarding a pickle on a hot kugel?

Answers coming be"H next week.

⁸ Certain clauses must be added, which we will be"H deal with later.

⁹ Rav Moshe Feinstein writes that one may place **warm** food directly onto a hotplate that cannot cook. Common hotplates are hot enough to cook and therefore one must ask one's rav whether one may place food directly onto a hotplate. Certain Sephardic rabbonim permit placing cooked food directly onto a hotplate on Shabbos and once again one must ask one's rav.

¹⁰ HaRav Sternbuch shlita. The *Shulchan Aruch HaRav simon* 318:11 writes 'a dry item that is totally void of liquid' may be reheated. With respect to tea leaves boiled before Shabbos, the *Mishna Berura* writes that one must pour the essence from the leaves and they should be dry. Theirs is a stricter view.

One may receive and distribute these weekly shiurim by calling or writing: Office 99 Rechov Bayit Vegan, Yerushalayim, Phone Numbers: U.S. and Canada 732-370-3344 Israel 972-3-616-6340

South Africa 083-714-3166 UK 44-020-8731-6666 Australia 61-296835626 Switzerland 0114143 333 0288

• e-mail: shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com, or www.shemayisrael.com.

weekly sponsorships are available as well.

If you would like to send a question to Rav Ostroff, you can write to him at shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com.

Note: The purpose of this series is intended solely for the clarification of the topics discussed and not to render halachic decisions. It is intended to heighten everyone's awareness of important practical questions which do arise on this topic. One must consult with a proper halachic authority in order to receive p'sak.