



# THE SHABBOS WEEKLY

## HALACHA SERIES ON HILCHOS SHABBOS

Published by **פרד"י שושנים**  
**PIRCHIEI SHOSHANIM**

A Project of  
The Shema Yisrael Torah Network

based on the shiurim given by  
**RABBI DOVID OSTROFF shlita**

developed from the Chabura of the  
Shulchan Aruch Project

These halachos were shown by Rabbi Ostroff to **HaGaon HaRav Moshe Sternbuch, shlita**



Parshas Ki Sovo 5765

September 23, '05  
Volume IV Issue 48

*If the heat source on my stove is extinguished, for some reason, may I place the food on my neighbor's blech or hotplate?*

It is not uncommon for flames under the *blech* to blow out or for the hotplate to cease functioning. The only viable solution is to place the food on the blech or hotplate of a neighbor, provided of course that there is an *eiruv*. Recalling the five conditions mentioned in previous shiurim, the first three are imperative, i.e. food fully cooked, hot (Sephardim) warm (Ashkenazim), using a blech or hotplate.

*What about the other conditions?*

Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach writes that in moving food, both conditions are complied with. What can be better than continually being on a heat source! Food on a heat source is far better than holding it in the air and **intending** to return it, because it is **on** the heat source. When the fire is extinguished, for whatever reason, it is obvious that one intends that it continue to be on a heat source and consequently one may transfer the food to another blech or hotplate.<sup>1</sup> Rav Moshe Feinstein also permits this.<sup>2</sup>

*If someone accidentally removed the wrong container from the hotplate, may it be returned?*

It so happened that a guest tried to be helpful and removed a container of food from the blech without realizing that the cholent pot was removed - the next day's food - instead of the soup. Is it permitted to return the cholent to the blech?

On the one hand the food was removed without the intention of returning it and on the other,

the host intended on it being continuously on the fire, which is akin to 'intending to return'. The identical mistake was liable to happen to the host if the wrong container of food was removed.

Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach writes that one may return the container of food to the blech or hotplate on condition that it is fully cooked and has not completely cooled down.<sup>3</sup>

*How may I warm pieces of schnitzel on Shabbos?*

There are two main methods. The first and universally accepted is by placing the pieces of schnitzel on top of a pot that is already on a heat source.<sup>4</sup> For this method the existing pot need not be on a blech or hotplate, because one is not placing the schnitzel directly onto the heat source.

One may also place the schnitzel on top of the electric urn. Care must be taken that the schnitzel does not touch the actual urn otherwise the water inside the urn becomes *fleishig* (meaty). One should pre-cut two pieces of aluminum foil before Shabbos and place them on top of the urn (on Shabbos) and place the schnitzel on the foil.

*What is the other method?*

Place a plate or baking tin upside down on the existing blech or hotplate and place the pieces of schnitzel on it.<sup>5</sup> Several *poskim* hold that this is

<sup>1</sup> *SS"K* 1:23 footnote 69.

<sup>2</sup> *Igros Moshe Orach Chaim* vol. IV *bishul* – 38.

<sup>3</sup> See the *tikumin umiluim* 1:20. In such a case one may definitely rely on the *Ran* who holds that the last 2 conditions of *chazora* do not apply when removing food **on** Shabbos.

<sup>4</sup> *Simon* 253:5.

<sup>5</sup> See the *SS"K* 1:38 footnote 112 and the respective footnote in the *tikumin umiluim*.

not the normal method used for warming or cooking and therefore it may be done. It is not equal to placing the container directly on the blech, which may not be done on Shabbos. Others argue saying that placing food on an empty baking tin or plate on a blech is similar to placing it directly on a blech. One must therefore ask one's rav.

### **May one reheat a plate of soup in the same fashion?**

Definitely not. The reason one may reheat schnitzel is because it is a dry cooked food. The *halacha* says that *ein bishul achar bishul* (there is no cooking after cooking), meaning that cold cooked food is no longer subject to the prohibition of *bishul* and it may be reheated. And yet it may not be placed directly on a heat source, as stated, because it would appear like cooking – *mechzi kim'vashel*.<sup>6</sup>

Cold liquids are subject to the *issur* of *bishul* (*yesh bishul achar bishul*) and therefore cold liquids may not be placed anywhere near a heat source if it is liable to reach the temperature of *yad soledes bo*.<sup>7</sup> Even if one intends on removing it before it reaches that temperature, it may not be placed on a heat source.<sup>8</sup>

### **What about reheating a piece of chicken with gravy?**

Although the piece of chicken may be reheated as per the above methods, the gravy is subject to the *issur* of reheating. Although some *poskim* hold that if the majority is solid and the minority is liquid it may be reheated, the accepted custom is<sup>9</sup> that whenever liquid is present, even in a small quantity, the solid may not be reheated if the liquid could attain the temperature of *yad soledes bo*.<sup>10</sup> Moist solids are considered dry and may be reheated in the above manner.

---

<sup>6</sup> *Simon* 318:4,8.

<sup>7</sup> 40-45C or 104-113F.

<sup>8</sup> *Simon* 318:14 and *M"V* 90.

<sup>9</sup> See *Igros Moshe Orach Chaim* vol. IV *bishul* – 5.

<sup>10</sup> The *Shulchan Aruch HaRav simon* 318:11 says "a dry cooked food that has no liquid whatsoever...".

## **Vort on the Parsha**

We ask *Hashem* to look favorably from the Heavens and bless His holy people (26:15). The commentators query the uniqueness of *bikurim*, which grants us a special merit so that we may ask *Hashem* to bless us on account of it. We would normally not have the audacity to ask for favors from *Hashem* when we barely fulfill His basic wishes. Our *mitzvos* come short; our learning is insufficient etc. and yet after delivering *bikurim* we ask *Hashem* to look favorably on us.

Rav Sternbuch cites the T'chortkover Rebbe who says that the *mitzvah* of feeding and helping the poor differs from other *mitzvos*. A regular *mitzvah* is measured according to the involvement one invested in it, whether be it time, money, effort, excitement or *kavanah* (devotion, concentration). Benevolence and charity include an extra item – the benefit the beneficiary has from your goodwill, which is boundless. Even if you invested little *kavanah* and effort in the *mitzvah*, the beneficiary benefits regardless and in that sense the *mitzvah* is almost complete. It is on this account that we gather the audacity to ask *Hashem* to look favorably upon us.

---

## **Food For Thought**

**May I wrap the challa on the urn with a towel?**

**Would it make a difference if I wrapped it before Shabbos?**

**May one fill a thermos bottle with water from the urn on Shabbos?**

**Are there problems reheating baby formula on Shabbos?**

Answers coming be"H next week.

---

One may receive and distribute these weekly shiurim by calling or writing: Office 99 Rechov Bayit Vegan, Yerushalayim, Phone Numbers: U.S. and Canada 732-370-3344 Israel 972-3-616-6340

South Africa 083-714-3166 UK 44-020-8731-6666 Australia 61-296835626 Switzerland 0114143 333 0288

• e-mail: [shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com](mailto:shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com), or [www.shemayisrael.com](http://www.shemayisrael.com),

weekly sponsorships are available as well.

If you would like to send a question to Rav Ostroff, you can write to him at [shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com](mailto:shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com).

**Note:** The purpose of this series is intended solely for the clarification of the topics discussed and not to render halachic decisions. It is intended to heighten everyone's awareness of important practical questions which do arise on this topic. One must consult with a proper halachic authority in order to receive p'sak.