

# THE SHABBOS WEEKLY

## HALACHA SERIES ON HILCHOS SHABBOS

Published by



A Project of  
The Shema Yisrael Torah Network

based on the shiurim given by

RABBI DOVID  
OSTROFF shlita

developed from the Chabura of the  
Shulchan Aruch Project

These halachos were shown by Rabbi Ostroff to HaGaon HaRav Moshe Sternbuch, shlita

Parshas Devorim 5765

**May one eat food warmed in the absence of a  
blech or hotplate?**

We differentiate between the opinion of the *Mechaber* and the *Rama*.

The *Mechaber* holds that food may *l'chatchila*<sup>1</sup> be placed on an empty flame before *Shabbos* if it is fully cooked and *מצטמך ורע לו* (in the process of shriveling or drying out).<sup>2</sup> If one unknowingly acted contrary to the *halacha* and placed food less than that degree on an open flame, it depends:

- If it is fully cooked and *ויפה לו* (shriveling beneficially) one may consume the food. The *poskim* explain that since the food was fully cooked when placed on the flames, the benefit from any additional cooking is marginal and the food is therefore permitted.<sup>3</sup>
- If not fully cooked one may not consume the food until after *Shabbos*.<sup>4</sup>

**What does the *Rama* hold?**

According to the *Rama*, one may place on open flames food cooked to the degree of *ma'achal Ben Derosai* – half cooked, before *Shabbos*.<sup>5</sup> (We learned that according to the *Chazon Ish* this is *l'chatchila* and according to

<sup>1</sup> In the first place.

<sup>2</sup> *Simon* 253:1.

<sup>3</sup> *M"b simon* 253:30.

<sup>4</sup> *Simon* 253:1.

<sup>5</sup> *Simon* 253:1.

August 12, '05  
Volume IV Issue 43

the *Mishna Berura* it is permitted only when necessary but not *l'chatchila*).

Food cooked less than the degree of *ma'achal Ben Derosai* placed on flames before *Shabbos* may not be eaten until after *Shabbos*.<sup>6</sup>

**Is the food prohibited for all?**

The food is prohibited unto all. This includes the person who placed it on the fire, that person's household and everyone else.<sup>7</sup> Consequently one cannot exchange one's food with a neighbor (even when there is an *eiruv*), because the neighbor is not permitted to consume that food on *Shabbos*.

**When may one consume this food?**

We find a *machlokes* in the matter. There is a concept in *halacha* called *bichdei she'ya'asu* – the time it takes. If, for example, the food was only half cooked when placed on open flames before *Shabbos*, one calculates the 'time it takes' to become fully cooked. After *Shabbos* one may eat this food after 'that time' - *bichdei she'ya'asu*.

With respect to this case we have a *machlokes*, where one opinion holds that one must wait *bichdei she'ya'asu* after *Shabbos*,<sup>8</sup> while the other opinion holds that one may consume

<sup>6</sup> Since there is an opinion that *ma'achal Ben Derosai* is a third cooked, *b'diavad* when placed before *Shabbos* it may probably be relied upon and a *rav* must be asked.

<sup>7</sup> *M"b simon* 253:31 and *Sha'ar Hatsiun* 33. *Shulchan Aruch HaRav* 253:12.

<sup>8</sup> *Hagagos Ashri*, cited in *M"b* 253:32.

it right after Shabbos without having to wait *bichdei she'ya'asu*.<sup>9</sup> It appears that the *M" B* rules like the latter opinion and the *Shulchan Aruch HaRav* rules like the former.<sup>10</sup>

#### *What is meant by 'unknowingly' placed?*

Unknowingly or *b'shogeig* means that one was unaware of the *halacha*, thinking it was permitted, or if food was left there unintentionally before Shabbos.<sup>11</sup>

#### *What if one placed it on open flames knowing that it was wrong?*

This is called *מזיד* or deliberate and according to all opinions it may only be consumed after Shabbos, plus the time of *bichdei she'ya'asu*. The *Mechaber* adds<sup>12</sup> that even if the food was fully cooked but not *מוצטמך ורע לו* one may only consume it after Shabbos.

Practically this is a strange case, because one who deliberately places it on open flames contrary to *halacha* will not be interested to know whether it may be consumed or not. Nevertheless we live in a strange world and it is possible that remorse eats at that person's heart and after placing it there he decides to act in accordance with *halacha*. As mentioned, the food is prohibited until after Shabbos plus *bichdei she'ya'asu*.

#### *What is the rationale to wait *bichdei she'ya'asu*?*

*Rashi* learns<sup>13</sup> that since the food improved on Shabbos, one must not gain benefit from an action performed contrary to *halacha*. The

<sup>9</sup> *Rambam* according to the *P'ri Megadim*, as cited in the *M" B* ibid.

<sup>10</sup> *Shulchan Aruch HaRav* 253:12.

<sup>11</sup> *Shulchan Aruch HaRav* 253:12.

<sup>12</sup> *Simon* 253:1.

<sup>13</sup> *Shabbos* 18b.

*Rambam* is concerned that if one was permitted to benefit from the food right after Shabbos one might be tempted to repeat it. By waiting *bichdei she'ya'asu* one will not gain from violating the *halacha*.<sup>14</sup>

#### **Vort on the Parsha**

In the *haftara* of *Shabbos Chazon*, we find the *posuk* saying "if you consent and comply with the *mitzvos*, you will eat the good of the land". The *K'sav Sofer* asks on the seemingly unnecessary word 'consent' as obviously if you comply you already consent. It is known that the rewards for *mitzvos* are in the next world and yet the *Midrashim* say that the *simcha* or excitement invested in the *mitzvah* is paid in this world. Accordingly, says the *K'sav Sofer*, that 'consent' refers to one's will and excitement when performing *mitzvos*, resulting in 'you will eat the good of the land'.

#### **Food For Thought**

*When does a concept of 'raw meat' come into play?*

*How does a crock-pot fit into all this?*

*When may I return a pot of food to the blech or hotplate?*

*May I ever return a pot of food to an oven?*

Answers coming be" H next week.

#### **Request**

The "Shabbos Shiur" has been provided for four years now at no cost to readers. In order to help defray expenses we would very much appreciate a small donation of \$5-\$10, either on a monthly or quarterly basis. It may be sent to Shabbos Shiur, POB 43034, Jerusalem 91430. Birthdays, anniversaries, weddings, yohrtzeits or such can be advertised on the sheet as well.

<sup>14</sup> *ה ב כדי שיעשו ב"ה*.