



Parshas Emor 5765

May 13, '05

Volume IV Issue 30

Must seudah sh'lishis be eaten after mincha?

This question was pertinent this year when *erev Pesach* was on Shabbos and eating bread was only permitted in the morning. The usual *seudah sh'lishis* with bread was not possible after *mincha*. Likewise, one who prefers to eat *seudah sh'lishis* at home and go to shul to learn for the remainder of the day? The *Tur* writes¹ that the time for *seudah sh'lishis* is not before *mincha gedola*, which is 6.5 hours into the day.² The *Beis Yosef* writes that this view is shared by many *Rishonim* although there are those who say that *seudah sh'lishis* may be eaten in the morning. This does not mean that one must actually *daven mincha* beforehand, as we will soon see. Therefore, splitting the morning *seudah*, i.e. *bentching*, waiting a short while and washing for bread again, is not a viable solution, but this issue should be dealt with before the next time *erev Pesach* falls on Shabbos, which is five years.

Well, what about davening mincha beforehand?

The *Rambam* depicts (30:10) the schedule of *tzaddikim* on Shabbos: "One *davens shacharis* and *mussafin shul* and goes home to eat the second meal. One then goes back to *shul* and

learns until *mincha*. One then *davens mincha* and eats *seudah sh'lishis*".

The *Tur* understands that one must *daven mincha* before *seudah sh'lishis* and so do other *Rishonim*.³ *Rabeinu Tam* however preferred that *seudah sh'lishis* be eaten before *mincha* as he held that water may not be consumed between *mincha* and *ma'ariv* for kabalistic reasons. The *poskim* explain that he was referring to river water only and therefore the custom to first *daven mincha* prevails. The *Kaf Hachaim*⁴ cites many *poskim* who hold that one should preferably eat *seudah sh'lishis* after *mincha*. The *Ari HaKadosh* held the same. If it is difficult for one to first *daven mincha*, one may first eat *seudah sh'lishis*⁵ and then *daven mincha*.⁶

Must one eat bread at seudah sh'lishis?

We mentioned in the past that optimally one must wash and eat bread for *seudah sh'lishis*.⁷ When one is satiated to the point that he will not enjoy the meal one may eat other foods, preferably from the five grains.

³ The *Darchei Moshe*³ cites the *Hagahos Mordechai*, the *Hagahos Maimoni* and others.

⁴ *Simon* 291:15.

⁵ There are certain complications when it is already *mincha ketana*, i.e. 2.5 hours before nightfall and a *rav* should be asked.

⁶ See the *SS"K* 56:3. The *Aruch HaShulchan* in *simon* 291:4 says that according to *kabala*, each meal is to be eaten after its respective prayer, i.e. the night meal after *ma'ariv* etc.

⁷ *Simon* 291:5.

¹ *Simon* 291:2.

² The day starts either from *alos hashachar* or from *neitz hashamah*. These times can be found on Jewish calendars.

Should the challos be covered at seudah sh'lishis as well?

We should first understand why the *challos* need be covered and then discuss *seudah sh'lishis*.

The *Tur*⁸ cites two reasons for covering the *challos*.

The first is a *Yerushalmi* that says that *challos* should not be embarrassed during *kiddush*. One usually recites *hamotzi* before *hagefen* being that wheat - *chitah* is mentioned in the *possuk* “*eretz chitah us'orah gefen...*” before the *gefen*. It is only when the *kiddush* is recited over wine that the *boreh p'ri hagefen* is recited before the *hamotzi* and since the *b'racha* is out of order the *challos* must be covered.

The second is to imitate the manna, which was covered beneath and above with dew. We therefore place a cloth beneath (the table cloth) and above the *challos*.

The *nafka mina* (difference) between the two reasons is when the *b'racha* of wine is not recited prior to *hamotzi*, that is when *kiddush* is not recited. Since we are not accustomed to make *kiddush* at *seudah sh'lishis*, only the reason of the manna applies and not the reason of wine.

Consequently one *l'chatchila* should cover the *challos* at *seudah sh'lishis* as well,⁹ but apparently custom is not so.

How long after sunset may one begin eating seudah sh'lishis, if at all?

Preferably one must commence eating before sunset.¹⁰ Rav Sternbuch *shlita* relates that the *Chazon Ish* would not permit household members to wash after sunset

and yet the Brisker Rav permitted washing up to 10 minutes after sunset.

One should definitely try to wash beforehand for various reasons. One is because it is a mitzvah to eat the three Shabbos meals during the actual Shabbos day, based on the *possuk* “אכלוהו היום” – three meals must be eaten on this day.¹¹

Vort on the Parsha

The *possuk* states “that you shall call them holy days those are My festivals”. The *Seforno* points out that *Hashem* is telling us that if we sanctify our festivals and gather people for holy matters and they rejoice with *Hashem*, the festivals are *Hashem's*. But if one merely utilizes the festivals for physical pleasures and everyday activities, they are not *Hashem's* festivals, only ours, which He despises. Rav Sternbuch *shlita* points out that *Chol HaMoed* is called “*mikra kodesh*” which is similar to the Yom Tov itself, and as such it too must merit a degree of holiness to be worthy to be called *Hashem's* festivals.

Food For Thought

May one perform melacha before reciting havdala?

Are women obliged to hear havdala?

May women recite havdala for themselves?

What may one eat or drink before havdala?

Answers coming be"H next week.

⁸ *Simon* 271:9.

⁹ See also *M"B Simon* 271:41 that the *nafka mina* applies when one makes *kiddush* on the *challos*.

¹⁰ *M"B Simon* 299:2. *SS"K* 56:4 and footnotes 16-17.

¹¹ See *M"B Simon* 267:5 and *SS"K* 56 footnote 15.

Dedicated for the hatzlacha of Ilana bas Yehudis.

One may receive and distribute these weekly shiurim by calling or writing: Office 99 Rechov Bayit Vegan, Yerushalayim, Phone Numbers: U.S. and Canada 732-370-3344 Israel 972-3-616-6340

South Africa 083-714-3166 UK 44-020-8731-6666 Australia 61-296835626 Switzerland 0114143 333 0288

• e-mail: shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com, or www.shemayisrael.com,

weekly sponsorships are available as well.

If you would like to send a question to Rav Ostroff, you can write to him at shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com.

Note: The purpose of this series is intended solely for the clarification of the topics discussed and not to render halachic decisions. It is intended to heighten everyone's awareness of important practical questions which do arise on this topic. One must consult with a proper halachic authority in order to receive p'sak.